



# Inclusive fitness theory and eusociality

## Citation

Abbot, Patrick, Jun Abe, John Alcock, Samuel Alizon, Joao A. C. Alpedrinha, Malte Andersson, Jean-Baptiste Andre, et al. 2011. "Inclusive Fitness Theory and Eusociality." Nature 471, no. 7339: E1–E4.

## Published Version

doi:10.1038/nature09831

## Permanent link

<http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:12712839>

## Terms of Use

This article was downloaded from Harvard University's DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Open Access Policy Articles, as set forth at <http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#OAP>

# Share Your Story

The Harvard community has made this article openly available.  
Please share how this access benefits you. [Submit a story](#).

[Accessibility](#)

## **Inclusive fitness theory and eusociality**

Nowak et al. (hereafter “NTW”) argue that inclusive fitness (IF) theory has been of little value in explaining the natural world, and that it has led to negligible progress in explaining the evolution of eusociality. However, their arguments are based on a misunderstanding of evolutionary theory and a misrepresentation of the empirical literature. We do not have space to go into all their specific errors, and so we will focus upon three general issues.

First, is there a sharp distinction between IF theory and “standard natural selection theory”? No. Natural selection explains the appearance of design in the living world, and IF theory explains what this design is for. Specifically, natural selection leads organisms to become adapted as if to maximize their IF<sup>1-3</sup>. IF theory is based on population genetics, and is used to make falsifiable predictions about how natural selection shapes phenotypes, and so it is not surprising that it generates identical predictions to those obtained using other methods<sup>1,4-6</sup>.

Second, does IF require a number of “stringent assumptions” such as pairwise interactions, weak selection, linearity, additivity and special population structures? No. Hamilton’s original formulations did not make all these assumptions, and generalisations have shown that none of them are required<sup>2,4,5,7</sup>. IF is as general as the genetical theory of natural selection itself. It is simply a partition of natural selection into its direct and indirect components.

NTW’s error is to have confused the completely general theory of IF with models of specific cases. Yes, researchers often make limiting assumptions for reasons of analytical tractability when considering specific scenarios<sup>4,6</sup>, as with any modelling approach. For example, NTW assume a specific form of genetic control, where dispersal and helping are determined by the same single locus, that mating is monogamous, and so on. However, the general IF approach has facilitated, not hindered, empirical testing of IF theory<sup>8-10</sup>. Indeed, an advantage of IF theory is that it readily generates testable predictions in situations where the precise genetic architecture of a phenotypic trait is unknown.

Third, NTW claim that IF theory “does not provide any additional biological insight”. They argue that it has delivered only “hypothetical explanations”, leading only to “routine” measurements and “correlative studies”, and that the theory has “evolved into an abstract enterprise on its own”, with a “failure to consider multiple competing hypotheses”. We cannot explain these puzzling claims, which completely neglect the extensive empirical literature that has accumulated over the past 40 years in the fields of behavioural and evolutionary ecology<sup>8-10</sup> (Table 1). Of course, studies must consider the direct consequences of behaviours, as well as consequences for relatives, but no one claims otherwise, and this does not change the fact that relatedness (and a load of other variables) has been shown to be important in all the above areas.

We do not have space to detail all the advances that have been made in the areas described in Table 1. However, the falseness of NTW’s claims is easily demonstrated with a single example, that of sex allocation (the ratio of investment into males versus females). We choose sex allocation because: (a) NTW argue that IF theory has provided only “hypothetical explanations” in this field; and (b) it is an easily

quantified social trait, which IF theory predicts can be influenced by interactions between relatives; (3) the study of sex allocation has been central to evolutionary work on the eusocial insects. In undeniable contrast to NTW's claims, recent reviews of sex allocation show that the theory has provided strong explanation for why sex allocation varies with variables such as female density, inbreeding rate, dispersal rate, brood size, order of oviposition, sibmating, asymmetrical larval competition, mortality rate, the presence of helpers, resource availability and nest density in organisms such as protozoan parasites, worms, insects, spiders, mites, reptiles, birds, mammals and plants<sup>4,11,12</sup>.

The quantitative success of this research can be summarized in one statistic: the percentage of the variance explained in the data. IF theory has explained up to 96% of the sex ratio variance in across-species studies and 66% in within-species studies<sup>12</sup>. The average for evolutionary and ecological studies is 5.4%. In addition, as well as explaining adaptive variation in behaviour, IF theory has even elucidated when and why individuals make mistakes (maladaptation), in response to factors such as mechanistic constraints<sup>12</sup>. It is not clear how NTW can characterize such quantifiable ringing success as "meagre". Their conclusions are based upon a selection of just three papers (by authors who all strongly disagree with NTW's interpretations), out of an empirical literature of thousands of research articles. This betrays a failure to seriously engage with the body of work that they would have us abandon.

The same points can be made with regard to the evolution of the eusocial insects, which NTW suggest cannot be explained by IF theory. Haplodiploidy itself may have only a relatively minor bearing on the origin of eusociality, but by impugning the value of IF theory as well, Nowak et al. discard the baby with the bathwater. IF theory has explained why eusociality has evolved only in monogamous lineages, and why it is correlated with certain ecological conditions, such as extended parental care and defence of a shared resource<sup>13,14</sup>. Furthermore, IF theory has made very successful predictions about behaviour in eusocial insects, explaining a wide range of phenomena (Table 2).

Ultimately, any body of biological theory must be judged on its ability to make novel predictions and explain biological phenomena. The most striking fact about NTW's offering is that it does neither. The only prediction made by their model (offspring are favoured to help their monogamously-mated mother if this provides a sufficient benefit), merely confirms, in a less general way, Hamilton's original and immensely important point: if the fitness benefits are great enough, then altruism can be favoured between relatives.

- 1 Hamilton, W. D. The genetical evolution of social behaviour, I & II. *J. Theor. Biol.* **7**, 1-52 (1964).
- 2 Hamilton, W. D. Selfish and spiteful behaviour in an evolutionary model. *Nature* **228**, 1218-1220 (1970).
- 3 Grafen, A. Optimisation of inclusive fitness. *Journal of Theoretical Biology* **238**, 541-563 (2006).
- 4 Frank, S. A. *Foundations of Social Evolution*. (Princeton University Press, 1998).

- 5     Gardner, A., West, S. A. & Barton, N. H. The relation between multilocus population genetics and social evolution theory. *American Naturalist* **169**, 207-226 (2007).
- 6     Rousset, F. *Genetic structure and selection in subdivided populations*. (Princeton University Press, 2004).
- 7     Queller, D. C. A general model for kin selection. *Evolution* **46**, 376-380 (1992).
- 8     Krebs, J. R. & Davies, N. B. *Behavioural Ecology. An Evolutionary Approach. 4th Ed.*, (Blackwell Scientific, 1997).
- 9     Foster, K. R. A defense of sociobiology. *Cold Spring Harb Symp Quant Bio* **74**, 403-418 (2009).
- 10    Westneat, D. F. & Fox, C. W. *Evolutionary Behavioral Ecology*. (Oxford University Press, 2010).
- 11    Hardy, I. C. W. *Sex ratios: concepts and research methods*. (Cambridge University Press, 2002).
- 12    West, S. A. *Sex Allocation*. (Princeton University Press, 2009).
- 13    Queller, D. C. & Strassmann, J. E. Kin selection and social insects. *Biocscience* **48**, 165-175 (1998).
- 14    Boomsma, J. J. Lifetime monogamy and the evolution of eusociality. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B* **364**, 3191-3208 (2009).
- 15    Ratnieks, F. L. W., Foster, K. R. & Wenseleers, T. Conflict resolution in insect societies. *Annu. Rev. Entomol.* **51**, 581-608 (2006).

Author contributions: All authors contributed to the planning, writing and/or revising of this paper. Several others who contributed significantly are not in the author list, because individuals are only allowed to be an author on one reply.

Author information: The authors declare no competing interests. Correspondence should be addressed to SAW (Stuart.West@zoo.ox.ac.uk).

<b>Research Area</b>	<b>Correlational studies?</b>	<b>Experimental studies?</b>	<b>Interplay between theory and data?</b>
Sex allocation	✓	✓	✓
Policing	✓	✓	✓
Conflict resolution	✓	✓	✓
Cooperation	✓	✓	✓
Altruism	✓	✓	✓
Spite	✓	✓	✓
Kin discrimination	✓	✓	✓
Parasite virulence	✓	✓	✓
Parent-offspring conflict	✓	✓	✓
Sibling conflict	✓	✓	✓
Selfish genetic elements	✓	✓	✓
Cannibalism	✓	✓	✓
Dispersal	✓	✓	✓
Alarm calls	✓	✓	✓
Eusociality	✓	✓	✓
Genomic imprinting	✓	✓	✓

Table 1. Some example areas (non-exhaustive) in which IF theory has been vitally important in understanding a range of behavioural phenomena<sup>8-10</sup>. We are not suggesting that IF is the only way to model evolution, just that it has already proven an immensely productive and useful approach for studying eusociality and other social behaviours.

<b>Trait examined</b>	<b>Explanatory variables</b>	<b>Correlational studies?</b>	<b>Experimental studies?</b>	<b>Interplay between theory and data?</b>
Altruistic helping	Haplodiploidy vs diploidy	✓		✓
Worker egg laying	Worker policing	✓	✓	✓
Policing	Relatedness	✓	✓	✓
Level of cooperation	Costs, benefits and relatedness	✓	✓	✓
Intensity of work	Need for work and probability of becoming queen	✓	✓	✓
Sex allocation	Relatedness asymmetries due to variation in queen survival, queen number, and mating frequency	✓	✓	✓
Sex allocation	Resource availability	✓	✓	✓
Sex allocation	Competition for mates between related males	✓	✓	✓
Number of individuals trying to become reproductive	Presence of old queens	✓	✓	✓
Workers killing queens	Presence of workers, reproductives or other queens	✓		
Exclusion of non-kin	Colony membership	✓	✓	✓

Table 2. Example areas (non-exhaustive) in which IF theory has made very successful predictions about behaviour in eusocial insects<sup>11-15</sup>.

Patrick Abbot, Jun Abe, John Alcock, Samuel Alizon, Joao A.C. Alpedrinha, Malte Andersson, Jean-Baptiste Andre, Minus van Baalen, Francois Balloux, Sigal Balshine, Nick Barton, Leo W. Beukeboom, Jay M. Biernaskie, Trine Bilde, Gerald Borgia, Michael Breed, Sam Brown, Redouan Bshary, Angus Buckling, Nancy T. Burley, Max N. Burton-Chellew, Michael A. Cant, Michel Chapuisat, Eric L. Charnov, Tim Clutton-Brock, Andrew Cockburn, Blaine J. Cole, Nick Colegrave, Leda Cosmides, Iain D. Couzin, Jerry A. Coyne, Scott Creel, Bernard Crespi, Robert L. Curry, Sasha R.X. Dall, Troy Day, Janis L. Dickinson, Lee Alan Dugatkin, Claire El Mouden, Stephen T. Emlen, Jay Evans, Regis Ferriere, Jeremy Field, Susanne Foitzik, Kevin Foster, William A. Foster, Charles Fox, Juergen Gadau, Sylvain Gandon, Andy Gardner, Michael G. Gardner, Thomas Getty, Michael A. D. Goodisman, Alan Grafen, Rick Grosberg, Christina M. Grozinger, Pierre-Henri Gouyon, Darryl Gwynne, Paul Harvey, Ben J. Hatchwell, Jürgen Heinze, Heikki Helanterä, Ken R. Helms, Kim Hill, Natalie Jiricny, Rufus A. Johnstone, Alex Kacelnik, E. Toby Kiers, Hanna Kokko, Jan Komdeur, Judith Korb, Daniel Kronauer, Rolf Kümmerli, Laurent Lehmann, Timothy A. Linksvayer, Sébastien Lion, Bruce Lyon, James A. R. Marshall, Richard McElreath, Yannis Michalakis, Richard E. Michod, Douglas Mock, Thibaud Monnin, Robert Montgomerie, Allen J. Moore, Ulrich G. Mueller, Ronald Noë, Samir Okasha, Pekka Pamilo, Geoff A. Parker, Ido Pen, Jes S. Pedersen, David Pfennig, David C. Queller, Daniel J. Rankin, Sarah E. Reece, Hudson K. Reeve, Max Reuter, Gilbert Roberts, Simon K. A. Robson, Denis Roze, Francois Rousset, Olav Rueppell, Joel Sachs, Lorenzo Santorelli, Paul Schmid-Hempel, Michael P. Schwarz, Tom Scott-Phillips, Paul W. Sherman, David M. Shuker, Jeff Smith, Joseph C. Spagna, Andrew Suarez, Liselotte Sundström, Michael Taborsky, Peter Taylor, Graham Thompson, John Tooby, Neil D. Tsutsui, Kazuki Tsuji, Stefano Turillazzi, Francisco Úbeda, Edward L. Vargo, Bernard Voelkl, Tom Wenseleers, Stuart A. West, Mary Jane West-Eberhard, David F. Westneat, Diane C. Wiernasz, Geoff Wild, Richard Wrangham, Andrew J. Young, David W. Zeh, Jeanne A. Zeh, Andrew Zink.

PA  
Vanderbilt University  
Nashville, TN 37235 USA

JA  
Laboratory of Applied Entomology  
Faculty of Agriculture  
Shizuoka University  
Shizuoka 422-8529  
Japan

JA  
Arizona State University [retired]

SA + YM  
UMR CNRS-IRD 2724, Genetics and Evolution of Infectious Diseases  
IRD, 911 Avenue Agropolis, B.P. 64501  
34394 Montpellier Cedex 5, France

JACA, JB, SB, AB, MB-C, PH, NJ, AK, LS, CEM, AG, SAW

Department of Zoology  
University of Oxford  
South Parks Road  
Oxford, OX1 3PS, UK

MA  
Department of Zoology  
University of Gothenburg  
SE 405 30 Gothenburg, Sweden

MvB  
Ecole Normale Supérieure, UMR 7625  
« Ecologie et Evolution », Paris, F-75005, France; Université  
Pierre et Marie Curie, UMR 7625  
« Ecologie et Evolution », Paris, F-75005, France; CNRS, UMR  
7625 « Ecologie et Evolution », Paris, F-75005, France. Bâtiment A  
7ème Etage CC237, 7 quai St.-Bernard, F-75252  
Paris cedex 05, France.

FB  
MRC Centre for Outbreak Analysis and Modelling,  
Department of Infectious Disease Epidemiology,  
Faculty of Medicine,  
Imperial College,  
St Mary's Campus,  
Norfolk Place,  
London W2 1PG,  
United Kingdom

SB  
Department of Psychology, Neuroscience & Behaviour  
McMaster University  
1280 Main St. West  
Hamilton, ON L8S 4K1 Canada

NB  
IST Austria  
Am Campus 1  
Klosterneuburg 3400

RB+LL  
Faculté des sciences  
Rue Emile-Argand 11,  
Case postale 158  
2000 Neuchâtel, Switzerland  
Australia

LB  
Evolutionary Genetics  
Centre for Ecological and Evolutionary Studies



University of Groningen  
P.O. Box 14, NL-9750 AA Haren  
The Netherlands

TB  
Aarhus University  
Department of Biological Sciences  
Ny Munkegade 1540  
8000 Aarhus C  
Denmark

GB  
Professor  
Department of Biology  
University of Maryland  
College Park, MD 20742-4415 USA

MB  
Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
University of Colorado,  
Boulder CO, USA

NB  
Dept Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
University of California  
321 Steinhaus Hall  
Irvine, CA 92697-2525 USA

MAC + SRXD + +AJM + AY  
Centre for Ecology and Conservation  
University of Exeter, Cornwall  
Tremough  
Penryn TR10 9EZ  
Cornwall  
UK

MC  
Department of Ecology and Evolution  
Biophore  
University of Lausanne  
1015 Lausanne  
Switzerland

TCB + WF + RJ  
Department of Zoology  
University of Cambridge  
Downing Street  
Cambridge  
CB2 3EJ UK

AC+HK  
Evolution, Ecology and Genetics  
Research School of Biology  
Australian National University  
Canberra, ACT 0200, Australia

BJC+DW  
Dept of Biology & Biochemistry  
University of Houston  
Houston TX 77204-5001 USA

NC+SR  
Institutes of Evolution, Immunology and Infection Research,  
School of Biological Sciences,  
Ashworth Laboratories,  
University of Edinburgh,  
Edinburgh EH9 3JT  
Scotland, UK

LC  
Department of Psychology  
University of California, Santa Barbara  
Santa Barbara, CA 93106-9660 USA

BC  
Department of Biosciences  
8888 University Drive  
Simon Fraser University, Burnaby BC V5A1S6 Canada

IC  
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology,  
Princeton University,  
Princeton, 08540, USA

RC  
Department of Biology  
Villanova University  
800 Lancaster Avenue  
Villanova, PA 19085 USA

JAC  
Department of Ecology and Evolution  
The University of Chicago  
1101 E. 57 Street  
Chicago, IL 60637 USA

Scott Creel  
Department of Ecology  
Montana State University  
Bozeman MT 59717 USA

TD+PT  
Dept Math&Stats  
Queen's University  
Kingston ON K7L 3N6

JLD  
The Cornell Lab of Ornithology  
Cornell University - The Johnson Center  
159 Sapsucker Woods Road  
Ithaca, NY 14850

LAD  
Department of Biology  
University of Louisville  
Louisville, KY, 40292 USA

HKR + PWS + JSS + SE  
Seeley G. Mudd Hall  
Department of Neurobiology and Behavior  
Cornell University  
Ithaca, New York 14853 USA

JE  
USDA-ARS Bee Research Lab  
BARC-E Bldg 476  
Beltsville, MD 20705 USA

RF  
Laboratoire Ecologie & Evolution, CNRS UMR 7625, Ecole Normale Supérieure, 46  
rue d'Ulm, 75005 Paris, France and  
2. Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology, University of Arizona, Tucson  
AZ 85721, USA.

JF  
School of Life Sciences  
John Maynard Smith Building  
University of Sussex  
Brighton BN1 9QG,  
UK

SF  
Department Biologie II Behavioral Ecology (Verhaltensökologie)  
Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität  
München Großhaderner Str. 2 D - 82152 Planegg / Martinsried Germany

KRF  
Center for Systems Biology  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, MA 02138

CF  
Department of Entomology  
University of Kentucky  
Lexington, KY 40546-0091 USA

JG  
School of Life Sciences  
Arizona State University  
PO Box 874501  
Tempe, AZ, 85287-4501 USA

MS + MGG  
School of Biological Sciences,  
Flinders University,  
GPO Box 2100,  
Adelaide, SA 5001,  
Australia

SG  
CEFE - UMR 5175  
1919 route de Mende  
F-34293 Montpellier cedex 5  
France

TG  
Kellogg Biological Station & Department of Zoology  
Michigan State University  
Hickory Corners, MI 49060 USA

MADG  
School of Biology and Petit Institute for Bioengineering and Bioscience  
Georgia Institute of Technology  
310 Ferst Drive  
Atlanta, GA 30332-0230  
USA

RG  
Department of Evolution & Ecology  
College of Biological Sciences  
1 Shields Avenue  
UC Davis  
Davis, CA 95616  
USA

CMG  
Center for Pollinator Research  
Huck Institutes of the Life Sciences  
Pennsylvania State University  
Chemical Ecology Lab 4A

University Park, PA 16802 USA

P-HG

Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, CP39, 12 rue Buffon 75005 Paris France

DG

Biology Department  
University of Toronto  
3359 Mississauga Road  
Mississauga ON L5L 1C6 Canada

BH

Department of Animal & Plant Sciences  
University of Sheffield  
Western Bank  
Sheffield S10 2TN  
UK

HH+LS

University of Helsinki  
Department of Biosciences POB 65, FI-00014  
University of Helsinki, Finland

JH

Biologie I  
Universität Regensburg  
D-93040 Regensburg, Germany

KH

Department of Biology  
University of Vermont  
Burlington, VT 05405, USA

KH

School of Human Evolution and Social Change  
Arizona State University  
Tempe, Arizona 85287-2402 USA

ETK

Department of Animal Ecology, Institute of Ecological Science  
Faculty of Earth and Life Sciences, Vrije Universiteit  
De Boelelaan 1085  
NL-1081 HV Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

HK

Evolution, Ecology and Genetics, Research School of Biology (Banks  
Building 44), Australian National University, Canberra, ACT 0200,  
Australia

JK  
Animal Ecology Group, Centre for Evolutionary and Ecological Studies  
University of Groningen, PO Box 14  
9750 AA Haren  
The Netherlands.

JK  
University of Osnabrueck  
Barbarastr.11  
D-49076 Osnabrueck  
Germany

DK  
Harvard University  
Museum of Comparative Zoology  
26 Oxford St  
Cambridge, MA 02138  
USA

RK  
Environmental Microbiology  
Swiss Federal Institute of Aquatic Research and Technology  
Überlandstrasse 133  
CH-8600 Dübendorf  
Switzerland

SL  
School of Biological Sciences  
Royal Holloway, University of London  
Egham TW20 0EX, UK

BL  
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
University of California  
Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA

JARM  
Department of Computer Science  
University of Sheffield  
Sheffield UK

RMc  
Department of Anthropology and Center for Population Biology  
UC Davis, Davis CA 95616 USA

REM  
Dept. Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ, 85721

DM  
Dept. of Zoology

730 Van Vleet Oval  
University of Oklahoma  
Norman, OK 73019 USA

TM  
Laboratoire Écologie & Évolution CNRS UMR 7625  
Université Pierre et Marie Curie  
7 quai St Bernard, Bâtiment A 7ème étage, Case 237  
75 252 Paris Cedex 05, France

RM  
Dept Biology  
Queen's University  
Kingston  
Ontario K7L 3N6  
Canada

UGM  
Integrative Biology  
University of Texas at Austin  
1 University Station #C0930  
Austin, TX 78712, USA

RN  
Psychologie - Université de Strasbourg  
Ethologie des Primates - DEPE (IPHC CNRS UMR 7178) 23 rue Becquerel -  
Strasbourg 67087 CEDEX - France

SO  
Department of Philosophy,  
University of Bristol,  
Bristol BS8 1TB, U.K.

PP  
Biocenter Oulu and Department of Biosciences  
University of Helsinki  
Box 65  
00140 University of Helsinki  
Finland

GP  
Institute of Integrative Biology  
Biosciences Building  
Crown Street  
University of Liverpool  
LIVERPOOL L69 7ZB UK

IP  
Theoretical Biology group  
University of Groningen

PO Box 14, 9750 AA Haren, The Netherlands

JP + TL  
Centre for Social Evolution  
Department of Biology  
University of Copenhagen  
Universitetsparken 15  
DK-2100 Copenhagen  
Denmark

DP  
Department of Biology  
CB#3280, Coker Hall  
University of North Carolina  
Chapel Hill, NC 27599-3280 USA

DQ  
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
Rice University  
Houston TX, USA

DJR  
Department of Biochemistry  
University of Zurich  
Building Y27, Office J-46  
Winterthurstrasse 190  
CH-8057 Zurich, Switzerland  
Swiss Institute of Bioinformatics, Quartier Sorge Bâtiment Génopode, CH- 1015  
Lausanne, Switzerland)

GR  
Centre for Behaviour & Evolution, Institute of Neuroscience  
Faculty of Medical Sciences, Newcastle University  
Henry Wellcome Building, Framlington Place  
Newcastle upon Tyne, NE2 4HH

SKAR  
School of Marine & Tropical Biology  
James Cook University QLD 4811  
Australia

DR  
Station Biologique de Roscoff, CNRS-UPMC UMR 7144, 29680 Roscoff, France

FR  
Institut des Sciences de l'Evolution  
University of Montpellier 2  
Montpellier, France

MR



Research Department of Genetics, Evolution and Environment  
Faculty of Life Sciences  
University College London  
4 Stephenson Way  
London NW1 2HE, UK

OR

Department of Biology  
Univ. North Carolina at Greensboro  
312 Eberhart Bldg.  
Greensboro, NC 27403, USA

JS

Department of Biology  
3314 Spieth Hall  
University of California - Riverside  
Riverside, CA 92521

PS-H

ETH Zurich  
Institute of Integrative Biology (IBZ)  
Universitätsstrasse 16  
CH.8092 Zürich  
Switzerland

TS-P

School of Philosophy, Psychology and Language Sciences  
University of Edinburgh  
3 Charles Street  
Edinburgh  
EH8 9AD

DMS

School of Biology  
University of St Andrews  
Harold Mitchell Building  
St Andrews  
Fife KY16 9TH  
UK

JCS

*Assistant Professor of Biology*  
*William Paterson University of New Jersey*  
*300 Pompton Rd., Wayne NJ 07470*

BS

Department of Anthropology  
101 West Hall  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor Michigan 48109

AS

Department of Entomology and Department of Animal Biology  
University of Illinois, Urbana, IL 61801

MT

Behavioural Ecology  
Institute of Ecology and Evolution  
University of Bern  
Wohlenstrasse 50a  
CH-3032 Hinterkappelen  
Switzerland

GT

Department of Biology  
University of Western Ontario  
1151 Richmond Street North  
London, Ontario N6A 5B7  
Canada

JT

Department of Anthropology  
University of California  
Santa Barbara CA 93106-3210 USA

NDT

Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management  
130 Mulford Hall, #3114  
University of California Berkeley  
Berkeley CA, US

KT

Faculty of Agriculture  
University of the Ryukyus  
Okinawa 903-0213, Japan

ST

Dipartimento di Biologia Evoluzionistica  
Università degli Studi di Firenze,  
via Romana 17, 50125 Firenze, Italy

FU

Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
University of Tennessee Knoxville  
Knoxville, TN 37902, USA

BV

Institute for Theoretical Biology  
Humboldt University zu Berlin  
Invalidenstr. 43, D-10115 Germany

ELV  
Department of Entomology  
Box 7613  
North Carolina State University  
Raleigh, NC 27695-7613, U.S.A.

MJW-E  
Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute  
Apartado 0843-03092  
Balboa, Panamá

TW  
Dept. of Biology, Zoological Institute, K.U.Leuven,  
Naamsestraat 59, B-3000 Leuven, Belgium

DW  
Department of Biology  
101 Morgan Building  
University of Kentucky  
Lexington, KY 40506-0225 USA

RW  
Department of Human Evolutionary Biology  
Harvard University  
Cambridge MA, USA

DZ + JZ  
Department of Biology & Program in Ecology  
Evolution & Conservation Biology  
University of Nevada  
Reno, NV 89557 USA

AZ  
Department of Biology  
San Francisco State University  
San Francisco, CA 94132

(Authors in alphabetical order)